

2025 WL 343475

Only the Westlaw citation is currently available.

United States District Court, E.D. New York.

NATOSHA DUNSTON, Plaintiff,

v.

243 DEKALB AVE. LLC, and 243 DEKALB AVE. REST. CORP., Defendants.

24-cv-4437 (BMC)

|

Filed 01/30/2025

MEMORANDUM DECISION AND ORDER

COGAN, District Judge.

*1 Plaintiff is a serial filer under **Title III** of the **Americans with Disabilities Act** (See Exhibit A) who has sued defendants – a restaurant and an affiliated property company – for inaccessibility. The parties initially reached a settlement in principle and dismissed the case, but then plaintiff reopened the case after the agreement fell through. The Court scheduled post-dismissal proceedings, and the parties settled again. This time, to make sure the agreement would stick, the Court had the parties appear before it, “So Ordered” the settlement on the record, and expressly retained jurisdiction to enforce the settlement. And yet, here we are again. Claiming that defendants have breached their obligation to pay attorneys’ fees, plaintiff has moved to enforce the agreement.

The terms of the settlement as placed on the record were simple: defendants would provide, within six months (1) a portable ramp readily available with a doorbell and a sign instructing patrons to ring for assistance with entry, which shall be utilized to access the outdoor area; (2) one accessible table inside the dining room and one next to the bar; and (3) arrangements with the neighboring restaurant to share its accessible restroom with directive signage. Defendants also agreed to pay \$10,000 in attorneys’ fees and costs within 30 days by wire transfer.

Plaintiff’s motion does not mention the remedial steps required under the settlement agreement. Rather, her motion focuses only on the \$10,000 in attorneys’ fees. It is undisputed that defendants didn’t pay the whole \$10,000 (defense counsel places the blame on hospital stays and his clients’ mistaken assumption that there was insurance coverage to cover the settlement). It is also undisputed that defendants paid \$1,000 towards the attorneys’ fees. Defense counsel claims he accidentally left a “0” off the amount, although he now inconsistently maintains that it will still take a few days to pay the other \$9000. Plaintiff, tired of defendants’ antics, requests “an Order directing Defendants to deliver the outstanding \$9000 within five days or face contempt proceedings.”

A contract is a contract, and defendants’ excuses are insufficient. They are in breach. However, the remedy for defaulting on a monetary obligation is not a court injunction compelling the breaching party to make payment, which plaintiff requests. See [Ecopetrol S.A. v. Offshore Expl. and Prod. LLC](#), 172 F. Supp. 3d 691, 698 (S.D.N.Y. 2016); [Martens v. Smith Barney, Inc.](#), No. 96-cv-3779, 2003 WL 21543506 at *4 (S.D.N.Y. July 9, 2003). It is a money judgment for, here, the \$9000 that is still owed. See [Governor Clinton Co. v. Knott](#), 120 F.2d 149, 153 (2d Cir. 1941). Armed with that, plaintiff can proceed to execute the judgment like any other judgment creditor with a writ of execution or under [Fed. R. Civ. P. 69\(a\)](#) and N.Y. C.P.L.R. Article 52.

However, because the settlement here doesn’t just provide for the payment of attorneys’ fees, a judgment for breach of the settlement agreement shouldn’t either. The So-Ordered settlement required defendants to perform remedial measures to make the offending premises accessible. Such remediations are the only remedy allowed by the **ADA**; there is no damage remedy.

Importantly, the remedial component of the settlement agreement is not a money judgment. Enforcing the judgement would require defendant “to perform a specific act,” and Rule 70(a) provides that a court “may order” an injunction to enforce such an obligation. [Fed. R. Civ. P. 70\(a\)](#). Plaintiff’s counsel, seemingly uninterested in the provisions of the settlement agreement that benefit her client, did not ask for such an order. This strikes the Court as odd because, based on defendants’ failure to even pay the attorneys’ fees, the chances are slim to none that they have even started, let alone finished, remediating the inaccessibility problems identified in the settlement.

*2 It should be noted that plaintiff’s cookie-cutter complaint alleged more than 15 pages worth of specific **ADA** regulatory accessibility violations ([see](#) Exhibit B), and yet the settlement boiled down to the few minor items described above: one ramp, two tables, and a bathroom-sharing agreement with a neighboring restaurant. This furthers a concern that this Court, and many others, have expressed – that **Title III** of the **ADA** has primarily become a tool not used to ensure disabled persons can access privately operated **public accommodations**, but instead used by a specialized plaintiff’s bar against “mom and pop” operations (*i.e.*, bodegas, bars, restaurants, retail and convenience stores) to extract attorneys’ fees. [See, e.g., Winegard v. Golftec Intell. Prop. LLC](#), 674 F. Supp. 3d 21, 25-26 (E.D.N.Y. 2023). Courts worry that, although the plaintiff might receive a nominal cut of the fees, the subject premises are left in essentially the same condition they were in when the action was started. For this reason, the Second Circuit has more narrowly interpreted the standing requirements for **ADA** cases. [See Calcano v. Swarovski N. Am. Ltd.](#), 36 F.4th 68 (2d Cir. 2022). If the repairs are never going to be done despite a settlement requiring them, or the plaintiff is never going to frequent the establishment even the defendants do remediate, then the formulaic recitation in these **ADA** complaints – that the plaintiff would most certainly use the subject premises or website if she was able to access them – does not establish an injury in fact. [Id.](#) It is just a means of securing fees for plaintiff’s attorney.

The concern about these **ADA** cases is difficult to confirm because, in nearly all **ADA** cases, settlements happen outside the Court’s scrutiny. No court approval is necessary under the statute. One might think that if a plaintiff is truly interested in accessing the properties at the heart of these cases, she would have the Court approve the settlement and retain jurisdiction to ensure ease of enforcement. The fact that plaintiffs virtually never do so should further heighten courts’ concerns. Instead, plaintiffs usually file a plain vanilla stipulation of dismissal (or a notice of dismissal if the defendant agrees to settle before appearing) that the court doesn’t have to So Order under [Fed. R. Civ. P. 41\(a\)](#). For all the court knows, nothing happened except the payment of a nominal sum to the plaintiff and the payment of a far more substantial fee to the plaintiff’s lawyers.

The instant case is a rare scenario in which the court did retain jurisdiction, and plaintiff has requested to enforce the settlement. And this exception appears to confirm courts’ suspicions; plaintiff requests only to get the attorneys’ fee paid. Of course, as noted above, defendants have no viable defense for not paying it. The motion is therefore granted, and judgment will be entered accordingly.

However, to ensure that this action has been brought for plaintiff’s benefit, and not the benefit of her attorney, enforcement of that portion of the judgment requiring the payment of the \$9000 in attorneys’ fees is stayed pending a showing by plaintiff that: (a) the remedial changes contemplated by the judgment have been accomplished; and (b) the remedial changes contemplated in each of plaintiff’s other actions brought in this Court have also been implemented. [See Fed. R. Civ. P. 62](#). Because the settlement agreements for those other actions, if there are any, have not been publicly filed, they shall be submitted together with proof of performance.

SO ORDERED.

Dated: Brooklyn, New York

January 29, 2025

Exhibit A

ADA cases brought by Natosha Dunston in E.D.N.Y

Natosha Dunston is a plaintiff in 43 cases.

Tabular or graphical material not displayable at this time.

Exhibit B

Alleged ADA violations in Case No. 24-cv-4437

[missing text]

dangerous conditions and ADA violations, which preclude and/or limit Plaintiff's ability to access the Facility and full and equal enjoyment of the goods, services offered at the Facility include:

- I. Inaccessible entrance.
- II. Accessible route to establishment not provided as required.
- III. Accessible means of egress not provided as required.
- IV. Existing step at entrance acts as a barrier to accessibility.
- V. Required ramp not provided for step at entrance.

ADAAG 206 Accessible Routes ADAAG 206.1 General.

Accessible routes shall be provided in accordance with 206 and shall comply with Chapter 4.

ADAAG 206.2 Where Required.

*3 Accessible routes shall be provided where required by 206.2.

ADAAG 206.2.1 Site Arrival Points.

At least one accessible route shall be provided within the site from accessible parking spaces and accessible passenger loading zones; public streets and sidewalks; and public transportation stops to the accessible building or facility entrance they serve.

ADAAG 206.4 Entrances.

Entrances shall be provided in accordance with 206.4. Entrance doors, doorways, and gates shall comply with 404 and shall be on an accessible route complying with 402.

ADAAG 207 Accessible Means of Egress ADAAG 207.1 General.

Means of egress shall comply with section 1003.2.13 of the International Building Code (2000 edition and 2001 Supplement) or section 1007 of the International Building Code (2003 edition) (incorporated by reference, "Referenced Standards" in Chapter 1).

ADAAG 402 Accessible Routes ADAAG 402.1 General.

Accessible routes shall comply with 402.

ADAAG 402.2 Components.

Accessible routes shall consist of one or more of the following components: walking surfaces with a running slope not steeper than 1:20, doorways, ramps, curb ramps excluding the flared sides, elevators, and platform lifts. All components of an accessible route shall comply with the applicable requirements of Chapter 4.

ADAAG 403 Walking Surfaces ADAAG 403.4 Changes in Level. Changes in level shall comply with 303

ADAAG 303.4 Ramps.

Changes in level greater than $1/2$ inch high shall be ramped, and shall comply with 405 or 406.

VI. Required minimum maneuvering clearance not provided at the first of two doors at entrance.

VII. Non-compliant change in floor level within required maneuvering clearance at the first of two doors at entrance.

ADAAG 206 Accessible Routes ADAAG 206.1 General.

Accessible routes shall be provided in accordance with 206 and shall comply with Chapter 4.

ADAAG 206.2 Where Required.

Accessible routes shall be provided where required by 206.2.

ADAAG 206.2.1 Site Arrival Points.

At least one accessible route shall be provided within the site from accessible parking spaces and accessible passenger loading zones; public streets and sidewalks; and public transportation stops to the accessible building or facility entrance they serve.

ADAAG 206.4 Entrances.

Entrances shall be provided in accordance with 206.4. Entrance doors, doorways, and gates shall comply with 404 and shall be on an accessible route complying with 402.

ADAAG 206.4.1 Public Entrances.

In addition to entrances required by 206.4.2 through 206.4.9, at least 60 percent of all public entrances shall comply with 404.

ADAAG 207 Accessible Means of Egress ADAAG 207.1 General.

Means of egress shall comply with section 1003.2.13 of the International Building Code (2000 edition and 2001 Supplement) or section 1007 of the International Building Code (2003 edition) (incorporated by reference, "Referenced Standards" in Chapter 1)

ADAAG 404.2.4 Maneuvering Clearances.

Minimum maneuvering clearances at doors and gates shall comply with 404.2.4.

Maneuvering clearances shall extend the full width of the doorway and the required latch side or hinge side clearance.

*4 ADAAG 404.2.4.4 Floor or Ground Surface.

Floor or ground surface within required maneuvering clearances shall comply with 302. Changes in level are not permitted.

VIII. Required minimum maneuvering clearance not provided in vestibule at exterior side of the second of two doors at entrance.

ADAAG 206 Accessible Routes ADAAG 206.1 General.

Accessible routes shall be provided in accordance with 206 and shall comply with Chapter 4.

ADAAG 206.2 Where Required.

Accessible routes shall be provided where required by 206.2.

ADAAG 206.2.1 Site Arrival Points.

At least one accessible route shall be provided within the site from accessible parking spaces and accessible passenger loading zones; public streets and sidewalks; and public transportation stops to the accessible building or facility entrance they serve.

ADAAG 206.4 Entrances.

Entrances shall be provided in accordance with 206.4. Entrance doors, doorways, and gates shall comply with 404 and shall be on an accessible route complying with 402.

ADAAG 206.4.1 Public Entrances.

In addition to entrances required by 206.4.2 through 206.4.9, at least 60 percent of all public entrances shall comply with 404.

ADAAG 207 Accessible Means of Egress ADAAG 207.1 General.

Means of egress shall comply with section 1003.2.13 of the International Building Code (2000 edition and 2001 Supplement) or section 1007 of the International Building Code (2003 edition) (incorporated by reference, "Referenced Standards" in Chapter 1)

ADAAG 404.2.4 Maneuvering Clearances.

Minimum maneuvering clearances at doors and gates shall comply with 404.2.4.

Maneuvering clearances shall extend the full width of the doorway and the required latch side or hinge side clearance.

IX. Inaccessible dining tables located at exterior dining area.

X. Required minimum knee and toe clearance not provided at dining tables located at exterior dining area.

XI. A minimum percentage of existing dining tables required to be accessible not provided at exterior dining area.

ADAAG 226 Dining Surfaces and Work Surfaces ADAAG 226.1 General.

Where dining surfaces are provided for the consumption of food or drink, at least 5 percent of the seating spaces and standing spaces at the dining surfaces shall comply with 902.

ADAAG 902 Dining Surfaces and Work Surfaces ADAAG 902.1 General. Dining surfaces and work surfaces shall comply with 902.2 and 902.3.

ADAAG 902.2 Clear Floor or Ground Space.

A clear floor space complying with 305 positioned for a forward approach shall be provided. Knee and toe clearance complying with 306 shall be provided.

ADAAG 306.2 Toe Clearance.

ADAAG 306.2.3 Minimum Required Depth.

Where toe clearance is required at an element as part of a clear floor space, the toe clearance shall extend 17 inches (430 mm) minimum under the element.

ADAAG 306.2.5 Width.

Toe clearance shall be 30 inches (760 mm) wide minimum.

ADAAG 306.3 Knee Clearance.

ADAAG 306.3.3 Minimum Required Depth.

Where knee clearance is required under an element as part of a clear floor space, the knee clearance shall be 11 inches deep minimum at 9 inches above the ground, and 8 inches deep minimum at 27 inches (685 mm) above the finish floor or ground.

***5** ADAAG 306.3.5 Width.

Knee clearance shall be 30 inches (760 mm) wide minimum.

XII. Inaccessible dining tables located at interior dining area.

XIII. Required minimum knee and toe clearance not provided at dining tables located at interior dining area.

XIV. A minimum percentage of existing dining tables required to be accessible not provided at interior dining area.

ADAAG 226 Dining Surfaces and Work Surfaces ADAAG 226.1 General.

Where dining surfaces are provided for the consumption of food or drink, at least 5 percent of the seating spaces and standing spaces at the dining surfaces shall comply with 902.

ADAAG 902 Dining Surfaces and Work Surfaces ADAAG 902.1 General.

Dining surfaces and work surfaces shall comply with 902.2 and 902.3.

ADAAG 902.2 Clear Floor or Ground Space.

A clear floor space complying with 305 positioned for a forward approach shall be provided. Knee and toe clearance complying with 306 shall be provided.

ADAAG 306.2 Toe Clearance.

ADAAG 306.2.3 Minimum Required Depth.

Where toe clearance is required at an element as part of a clear floor space, the toe clearance shall extend 17 inches (430 mm) minimum under the element.

ADAAG 306.2.5 Width.

Toe clearance shall be 30 inches (760 mm) wide minimum.

ADAAG 306.3 Knee Clearance.

ADAAG 306.3.3 Minimum Required Depth.

Where knee clearance is required under an element as part of a clear floor space, the knee clearance shall be 11 inches deep minimum at 9 inches above the ground, and 8 inches deep minimum at 27 inches (685 mm) above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 306.3.5 Width.

Knee clearance shall be 30 inches (760 mm) wide minimum.

XV. Inaccessible bar.

XVI. Non-compliant height of bar exceeds maximum height allowance.

XVII. Required minimum knee and toe clearance not provided at bar.

XVIII. Portion of bar required to be accessible not provided.

ADAAG 226 Dining Surfaces and Work Surfaces ADAAG 226.1 General.

Where dining surfaces are provided for the consumption of food or drink, at least 5 percent of the seating spaces and standing spaces at the dining surfaces shall comply with 902.

ADAAG 902 Dining Surfaces and Work Surfaces ADAAG 902.1 General.

Dining surfaces and work surfaces shall comply with 902.2 and 902.3.

Advisory 902.1 General.

Dining surfaces include, but are not limited to, bars, tables, lunch counters, and booths.

ADAAG 902.2 Clear Floor or Ground Space.

A clear floor space complying with 305 positioned for a forward approach shall be provided. Knee and toe clearance complying with 306 shall be provided.

ADAAG 902.3 Height.

The tops of dining surfaces and work surfaces shall be 28 inches (710 mm) minimum and 34 inches (865 mm) maximum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 306.2 Toe Clearance.

ADAAG 306.2.3 Minimum Required Depth.

Where toe clearance is required at an element as part of a clear floor space, the toe clearance shall extend 17 inches (430 mm) minimum under the element.

ADAAG 306.2.5 Width.

Toe clearance shall be 30 inches (760 mm) wide minimum.

ADAAG 306.3 Knee Clearance.

ADAAG 306.3.3 Minimum Required Depth.

*6 Where knee clearance is required under an element as part of a clear floor space, the knee clearance shall be 11 inches deep minimum at 9 inches above the ground, and 8 inches deep minimum at 27 inches (685 mm) above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 306.3.5 Width.

Knee clearance shall be 30 inches (760 mm) wide minimum.

XIX. The first of two restrooms is inaccessible.

XX. Required minimum clear width not provided at door of the first of two restrooms.

ADAAG 206 Accessible Routes ADAAG 206.1 General.

Accessible routes shall be provided in accordance with 206 and shall comply with Chapter 4.

ADAAG 402 Accessible Routes ADAAG 402.1 General.

Accessible routes shall comply with 402.

ADAAG 402.2 Components.

Accessible routes shall consist of one or more of the following components: walking surfaces with a running slope not steeper than 1:20, doorways, ramps, curb ramps excluding the flared sides, elevators, and platform lifts. All components of an accessible route shall comply with the applicable requirements of Chapter 4.

ADAAG 404.2.3 Clear Width.

Door openings shall provide a clear width of 32 inches (815 mm) minimum. Clear openings of doorways with swinging doors shall be measured between the face of the door and the stop, with the door open 90 degrees.

XXI. Required minimum maneuvering clearance not provided at door of the first of two restrooms.

ADAAG 206 Accessible Routes ADAAG 206.1 General.

Accessible routes shall be provided in accordance with 206 and shall comply with Chapter 4.

ADAAG 402 Accessible Routes ADAAG 402.1 General.

Accessible routes shall comply with 402.

ADAAG 402.2 Components.

Accessible routes shall consist of one or more of the following components: walking surfaces with a running slope not steeper than 1:20, doorways, ramps, curb ramps excluding the flared sides, elevators, and platform lifts. All components of an accessible route shall comply with the applicable requirements of Chapter 4.

ADAAG 404.2.4 Maneuvering Clearances.

Minimum maneuvering clearances at doors and gates shall comply with 404.2.4.

Maneuvering clearances shall extend the full width of the doorway and the required latch side or hinge side clearance.

XXII. Inaccessible door lock at door in the first of two restrooms.

XXIII. Non-compliant height of door lock at door in the first of two restrooms door exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 404 Doors, Doorways, and Gates ADAAG 404.1 General.

Doors, doorways, and gates that are part of an accessible route shall comply with 404.

ADAAG 404.2.7 Door and Gate Hardware.

Handles, pulls, latches, locks, and other operable parts on doors and gates shall comply with 309.4. Operable parts of such hardware shall be 34 inches (865 mm) minimum and 48 inches (1220 mm) maximum above the finish floor or ground.

XXIV. Non-compliant door lock at door of the first of two restrooms requires twisting of the wrist.

ADAAG 404 Doors, Doorways, and Gates ADAAG 404.1 General.

Doors, doorways, and gates that are part of an accessible route shall comply with 404.

ADAAG 404.2.7 Door and Gate Hardware.

Handles, pulls, latches, locks, and other operable parts on doors and gates shall comply with 309.4

ADAAG 309.4 Operation.

Operable parts shall be operable with one hand and shall not require tight grasping, pinching, or twisting of the wrist. The force required to activate operable parts shall be 5 pounds maximum.

*7 XXV. Non-compliant door knob at door of the first of two restrooms requires twisting of the wrist.

ADAAG 404 Doors, Doorways, and Gates ADAAG 404.1 General.

Doors, doorways, and gates that are part of an accessible route shall comply with 404.

ADAAG 404.2.7 Door and Gate Hardware.

Handles, pulls, latches, locks, and other operable parts on doors and gates shall comply with 309.4

ADAAG 309.4 Operation.

Operable parts shall be operable with one hand and shall not require tight grasping, pinching, or twisting of the wrist. The force required to activate operable parts shall be 5 pounds maximum.

XXVI. Non-compliant rise in floor level at threshold of door of the first of two restrooms acts as a barrier to accessibility.

XXVII. Required ramp not provided for non-compliant rise in floor level at threshold of door of the first of two restrooms.

ADAAG 206 Accessible Routes ADAAG 206.1 General.

Accessible routes shall be provided in accordance with 206 and shall comply with Chapter 4.

ADAAG 402 Accessible Routes ADAAG 402.1 General.

Accessible routes shall comply with 402.

ADAAG 402.2 Components.

Accessible routes shall consist of one or more of the following components: walking surfaces with a running slope not steeper than 1:20, doorways, ramps, curb ramps excluding the flared sides, elevators, and platform lifts. All components of an accessible route shall comply with the applicable requirements of Chapter 4.

ADAAG 404 Doors, Doorways, and Gates ADAAG 404.1 General.

Doors, doorways, and gates that are part of an accessible route shall comply with 404.

ADAAG 404.2.5 Thresholds.

Thresholds, if provided at doorways, shall be $1/2$ inch (13 mm) high maximum. Raised thresholds and changes in level at doorways shall comply with 302 and 303.

ADAAG 303.4 Ramps.

Changes in level greater than $1/2$ inch high shall be ramped, and shall comply with 405 or 406.

XXVIII. Inaccessible travel path to fixtures in the first of two restrooms.

XXIX. Required minimum clear width not provided at travel path to fixtures in the first of two restrooms.

ADAAG 402 Accessible Routes ADAAG 402.1 General. Accessible routes shall comply with 402.

ADAAG 402.2 Components.

Accessible routes shall consist of one or more of the following components: walking surfaces with a running slope not steeper than 1:20, doorways, ramps, curb ramps excluding the flared sides, elevators, and platform lifts. All components of an accessible route shall comply with the applicable requirements of Chapter 4.

ADAAG 403 Walking Surfaces ADAAG 403.1 General.

Walking surfaces that are a part of an accessible route shall comply with 403.

ADAAG 403.5.1 Clear Width.

Except as provided in 403.5.2 and 403.5.3, the clear width of walking surfaces shall be 36 inches (915 mm) minimum.

XXX. Inaccessible light switch in the first of two restrooms.

XXXI. Non-compliant height of light switch in the first of two restrooms exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 205 Operable Parts ADAAG 205.1 General.

Operable parts on accessible elements, accessible routes, and in accessible rooms and spaces shall comply with 309.

ADAAG Advisory 205.1 General.

Controls covered by 205.1 include, but are not limited to, light switches, circuit breakers, duplexes and other convenience receptacles, environmental and appliance controls, plumbing fixture controls, and security and intercom systems.

***8** ADAAG 309.3 Height.

Operable parts shall be placed within one or more of the reach ranges specified in 308

ADAAG 308.2 Forward Reach. ADAAG 308.2.1 Unobstructed.

Where a forward reach is unobstructed, the high forward reach shall be 48 inches (1220 mm) maximum and the low forward reach shall be 15 inches (380 mm) minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.2.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a high forward reach is over an obstruction, the clear floor space shall extend beneath the element for a distance not less than the required reach depth over the obstruction. The high forward reach shall be 48 inches (1220 mm) maximum where the reach depth is 20 inches (510 mm) maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 20 inches (510 mm), the high forward reach shall be 44 inches (1120 mm) maximum and the reach depth shall be 25 inches (635 mm) maximum.

ADAAG 308.3 Side Reach. ADAAG 308.3.1 Unobstructed.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the side reach is unobstructed, the high side reach shall be 48 inches (1220 mm) maximum and the low side reach shall be 15 inches (380 mm) minimum above the finish floor or ground.

EXCEPTIONS: 1. An obstruction shall be permitted between the clear floor or ground space and the element where the depth of the obstruction is 10 inches (255 mm) maximum.

ADAAG 308.3.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the high side Reach is over an obstruction, the height of the obstruction shall be 34 inches (865 mm) maximum and the depth of the obstruction shall be 24 inches (610 mm) maximum. The high side reach shall be 48 inches (1220 mm) maximum for a reach depth of 10 inches (255 mm) maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 10 inches (255 mm), the high side reach shall be 46 inches (1170 mm) maximum for a reach depth of 24 inches (610 mm) maximum.

XXXII. Required minimum turning space not provided in the first of two restrooms.

ADAAG 603 Toilet and Bathing Rooms

ADAAG 603.1 General.

Toilet and bathing rooms shall comply with 603.

ADAAG 603.2 Clearances. Clearances shall comply with 603.2.

ADAAG 603.2.1 Turning Space.

Turning space complying with 304 shall be provided within the room.

ADAAG 304.3.1 Circular Space.

The turning space shall be a space of 60 inches (1525 mm) diameter minimum.

The space shall be permitted to include knee and toe clearance complying with 306

XXXIII. Inaccessible lavatory in the first of two restrooms.

XXXIV. Required minimum clear floor space not provided at lavatory in the first of two restrooms.

ADAAG 606 Lavatories and Sinks.

ADAAG 606.2 Clear Floor Space.

A clear floor space complying with 305, positioned for a forward approach, and knee and toe clearance complying with 306 shall be provided.

ADAAG 305.3 Size.

The clear floor or ground space shall be 30 inches (760 mm) minimum by 48 inches (1220 mm) minimum.

XXXV. Non-compliant faucet knobs at lavatory in the first of two restrooms require twisting of the wrist.

ADAAG 606 lavatories and sinks.

***9** ADAAG 606.4 Faucets.

Controls for faucets shall comply with 309.

Hand-operated metering faucets shall remain open for 10 seconds minimum.

ADAAG 309 Operable Parts

ADAAG 309.4 Operation.

Operable parts shall be operable with one hand and shall not require tight grasping, pinching, or twisting of the wrist. The force required to activate operable parts shall be 5 pounds (22.2 N) maximum.

XXXVI. Required insulation of pipes and water lines under the lavatory in the first of two restrooms not provided.

ADAAG 606 Lavatories and Sinks.

ADAAG 606.5 Exposed Pipes and Surfaces.

Water supply and drain pipes under lavatories and sinks shall be insulated or otherwise configured to protect against contact. There shall be no sharp or abrasive surfaces under lavatories and sinks.

XXXVII. Inaccessible paper towel dispenser in the first of two restrooms.

XXXVIII. Non-compliant mounted height of paper towel dispenser in the first of two restrooms exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG Advisory 606.1 General.

If soap and towel dispensers are provided, they must be located within the reach ranges specified in 308.

ADAAG 308.2 Forward Reach. ADAAG 308.2.1 Unobstructed.

Where a forward reach is unobstructed, the high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low forward reach shall be 15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.2.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a high forward reach is over an obstruction, the clear floor space shall extend beneath the element for a distance not less than the required reach depth over the obstruction. The high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum where the reach depth is 20 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 20 inches, the high forward reach shall be 44 inches maximum and the reach depth shall be 25 inches maximum.

ADAAG 308.3 Side Reach. ADAAG 308.3.1 Unobstructed.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the side reach is unobstructed, the high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low side reach shall be

15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.3.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the high side reach is over an obstruction, the height of the obstruction shall be 34 inches maximum and the depth of the obstruction shall be 24 inches maximum. The high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum for a reach depth of 10 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 10 inches, the high side reach shall be 46 inches maximum for a reach depth of 24 inches maximum.

XXXIX. Inaccessible mirror in the first of two restrooms.

XL. Non-compliant mounted height of mirror in the first of two restrooms exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 603.3 Mirrors.

Mirrors located above lavatories or countertops shall be installed with the bottom edge of the reflecting surface 40 inches (1015 mm) maximum above the finish floor or ground.

Mirrors not located above lavatories or countertops shall be installed with the bottom edge of the reflecting surface 35 inches (890 mm) maximum above the finish floor or ground.

***10** XLI. Inaccessible toilet compartment in the first of two restrooms.

XLII. Required minimum clear width not provided at door of toilet compartment in the first of two restrooms.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments.

ADAAG 604.8 Toilet Compartments.

Wheelchair accessible toilet compartments shall meet the requirements of 604.8.1 and 604.8.3. Compartments containing more than one plumbing fixture shall comply with 603.

Ambulatory accessible compartments shall comply with 604.8.2 and 604.8.3.

ADAAG 604.8.1.2 Doors.

Toilet compartment doors, including door hardware, shall comply with 404 except that if the approach is to the latch side of the compartment door, clearance between the door side of the compartment and any obstruction shall be 42 inches (1065 mm) minimum.

Doors shall be located in the front partition or in the side wall or partition farthest from the water closet. Where located in the front partition, the door opening shall be 4 inches (100 mm) maximum from the side wall or partition farthest from the water closet. Where located in the side wall or partition, the door opening shall be 4 inches (100 mm) maximum from the front partition. The door shall be self-closing. A door pull complying with 404.2.7 shall be placed on both sides of the door near the latch. Toilet compartment doors shall not swing into the minimum required compartment area.

ADAAG 404.2.3 Clear Width.

Door openings shall provide a clear width of 32 inches (815 mm) minimum. Clear openings of doorways with swinging doors shall be measured between the face of the door and the stop, with the door open 90 degrees.

XLIII. Inaccessible water closet in toilet compartment in the first of two restrooms.

XLIV. Required minimum clearance not provided at water closet in toilet compartment in the first of two restrooms.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments

ADAAG 604.3 Clearance.

Clearances around water closets and in toilet compartments shall comply with 604.3.

ADAAG 604.3.1 Size.

Clearance around a water closet shall be 60 inches (1525 mm) minimum measured perpendicular from the side wall and 56 inches (1420 mm) minimum measured perpendicular from the rear wall.

XLV. Required grab bars not provided on rear and side walls of water closet in toilet compartment in the first of two restrooms.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments

ADAAG 604.5 Grab Bars.

Grab bars for water closets shall comply with 609.

Grab bars shall be provided on the side wall closest to the water closet and on the rear wall.

XLVI. Non-compliant distance of water closet from side wall in toilet compartment in the first of two restrooms.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments.

ADAAG 604.2 Location.

The water closet shall be positioned with a wall or partition to the rear and to one side.

The centerline of the water closet shall be 16 inches minimum to 18 inches maximum from the side wall or partition

XLVII. Inaccessible coat hook in the first of two restrooms.

XLVIII. Non-compliant height of coat hook in the first of two restrooms exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments.

***11** ADAAG 604.8.3 Coat Hooks and Shelves.

Coat hooks shall be located within one of the reach ranges specified in 308. ADAAG 308.2 Forward Reach. ADAAG 308.2.1 Unobstructed.

Where a forward reach is unobstructed, the high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low forward reach shall be 15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.2.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a high forward reach is over an obstruction, the clear floor space shall extend beneath the element for a distance not less than the required reach depth over the obstruction. The high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum where the reach depth is 20 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 20 inches, the high forward reach shall be 44 inches maximum and the reach depth shall be 25 inches maximum.

ADAAG 308.3 Side Reach. ADAAG 308.3.1 Unobstructed.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the side reach is unobstructed, the high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low side reach shall be

15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.3.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the high side reach is over an obstruction, the height of the obstruction shall be 34 inches maximum and the depth of the obstruction shall be 24 inches maximum. The high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum for a reach depth of 10 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 10 inches, the high side reach shall be 46 inches maximum for a reach depth of 24 inches maximum.

XLIX. Compliant signage identifying the second of two restrooms not provided as required.

ADAAG 216 Signs ADAAG 216.1 General.

Signs shall be provided in accordance with 216 and shall comply with 703.

ADAAG 216.2 Designations.

Interior and exterior signs identifying permanent rooms and spaces shall comply with 703.1, 703.2, and 703.5. Where pictograms are provided as designations of permanent interior rooms and spaces, the pictograms shall comply with 703.6 and shall have text descriptors complying with 703.2 and 703.5.

Advisory 216.2 Designations.

Section 216.2 applies to signs that provide designations, labels, or names for interior rooms or spaces where the sign is not likely to change over time.

Examples include interior signs labeling restrooms, room and floor numbers or letters, and room **names**. Tactile text descriptors are required for pictograms that are provided to label or identify a permanent room or space.

Pictograms that provide information about a room or space, such as “no smoking,” occupant logos, and the International Symbol of Accessibility, are not required to have text descriptors.

ADAAG 703.1 General.

Signs shall comply with 703. Where both visual and tactile characters are required, either one sign with both visual and tactile characters, or two separate signs, one with visual, and one with tactile characters, shall be provided.

ADAAG 703.4.1 Height Above Finish Floor or Ground.

Tactile characters on signs shall be located 48 inches (1220 mm) minimum above the finish floor or ground surface, measured from the baseline of the lowest tactile character and 60 inches (1525 mm) maximum above the finish floor or ground surface, measured from the baseline of the highest tactile character.

***12** ADAAG 703.4.2 Location.

Where a tactile sign is provided at a door, the sign shall be located alongside the door at the latch side. Where a tactile sign is provided at double doors with one active leaf, the sign shall be located on the inactive leaf. Where a tactile sign is provided at double doors with two active leaves, the sign shall be located to the right of the right hand door. Where there is no wall space at the latch side of a single door or at the right side of double doors, signs shall be located on the nearest adjacent wall. Signs containing tactile characters shall be located so that a clear floor space of 18 inches (455 mm) minimum by 18 inches (455 mm) minimum, centered on the tactile characters, is provided beyond the arc of any door swing between the closed position and 45 degree open position.

L. The second of two restrooms is inaccessible.

LI. Required minimum clear width not provided at door of the second of two restrooms.

ADAAG 206 Accessible Routes ADAAG 206.1 General.

Accessible routes shall be provided in accordance with 206 and shall comply with Chapter 4.

ADAAG 402 Accessible Routes ADAAG 402.1 General.

Accessible routes shall comply with 402.

ADAAG 402.2 Components.

Accessible routes shall consist of one or more of the following components: walking surfaces with a running slope not steeper than 1:20, doorways, ramps, curb ramps excluding the flared sides, elevators, and platform lifts. All components of an accessible route shall comply with the applicable requirements of Chapter 4.

ADAAG 404.2.3 Clear Width.

Door openings shall provide a clear width of 32 inches (815 mm) minimum. Clear openings of doorways with swinging doors shall be measured between the face of the door and the stop, with the door open 90 degrees.

LII. Required minimum maneuvering clearance not provided at door of the second of two restrooms.

ADAAG 206 Accessible Routes ADAAG 206.1 General.

Accessible routes shall be provided in accordance with 206 and shall comply with Chapter 4.

ADAAG 402 Accessible Routes ADAAG 402.1 General.

Accessible routes shall comply with 402.

ADAAG 402.2 Components.

Accessible routes shall consist of one or more of the following components: walking surfaces with a running slope not steeper than 1:20, doorways, ramps, curb ramps excluding the flared sides, elevators, and platform lifts. All components of an accessible route shall comply with the applicable requirements of Chapter 4.

ADAAG 404.2.4 Maneuvering Clearances.

Minimum maneuvering clearances at doors and gates shall comply with 404.2.4.

Maneuvering clearances shall extend the full width of the doorway and the required latch side or hinge side clearance.

LIII. Inaccessible door lock at door of the second of two restrooms.

LIV. Non-compliant height of door lock at door of the second of two restrooms door exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 404 Doors, Doorways, and Gates ADAAG 404.1 General.

Doors, doorways, and gates that are part of an accessible route shall comply with 404.

***13** ADAAG 404.2.7 Door and Gate Hardware.

Handles, pulls, latches, locks, and other operable parts on doors and gates shall comply with 309.4. Operable parts of such hardware shall be 34 inches (865 mm) minimum and 48 inches (1220 mm) maximum above the finish floor or ground.

LV. Non-compliant door lock at door of the second of two restrooms requires twisting of the wrist.

ADAAG 404 Doors, Doorways, and Gates ADAAG 404.1 General.

Doors, doorways, and gates that are part of an accessible route shall comply with 404.

ADAAG 404.2.7 Door and Gate Hardware.

Handles, pulls, latches, locks, and other operable parts on doors and gates shall comply with 309.4

ADAAG 309.4 Operation.

Operable parts shall be operable with one hand and shall not require tight grasping, pinching, or twisting of the wrist. The force required to activate operable parts shall be 5 pounds maximum.

LVI. Non-compliant door knob at door of the second of two restrooms requires twisting of the wrist.

ADAAG 404 Doors, Doorways, and Gates ADAAG 404.1 General.

Doors, doorways, and gates that are part of an accessible route shall comply with 404.

ADAAG 404.2.7 Door and Gate Hardware.

Handles, pulls, latches, locks, and other operable parts on doors and gates shall comply with 309.4

ADAAG 309.4 Operation.

Operable parts shall be operable with one hand and shall not require tight grasping, pinching, or twisting of the wrist. The force required to activate operable parts shall be 5 pounds maximum.

LVII. Required minimum turning space not provided in the second of two restrooms.

ADAAG 603 Toilet and Bathing Rooms

ADAAG 603.1 General.

Toilet and bathing rooms shall comply with 603.

ADAAG 603.2 Clearances. Clearances shall comply with 603.2.

ADAAG 603.2.1 Turning Space.

Turning space complying with 304 shall be provided within the room.

ADAAG 304.3.1 Circular Space.

The turning space shall be a space of 60 inches (1525 mm) diameter minimum.

The space shall be permitted to include knee and toe clearance complying with 306

LVIII. Inaccessible lavatory in the second of two restrooms.

LIX. Required minimum clear floor space not provided at lavatory in the second of two restrooms.

ADAAG 606 Lavatories and Sinks.

ADAAG 606.2 Clear Floor Space.

A clear floor space complying with 305, positioned for a forward approach, and knee and toe clearance complying with 306 shall be provided. ADAAG 305.3 Size.

The clear floor or ground space shall be 30 inches (760 mm) minimum by 48 inches (1220 mm) minimum.

LX. Non-compliant faucet knobs at lavatory in the second of two restrooms require twisting of the wrist.

ADAAG 606 Lavatories and Sinks.

ADAAG 606.4 Faucets.

Controls for faucets shall comply with 309.

Hand-operated metering faucets shall remain open for 10 seconds minimum.

ADAAG 309 Operable Parts

ADAAG 309.4 Operation.

Operable parts shall be operable with one hand and shall not require tight grasping, pinching, or twisting of the wrist. The force required to activate operable parts shall be 5 pounds (22.2 N) maximum.

LXI. Insulation of pipes and water lines under the lavatory in the second of two restrooms not provided as required.

***14** ADAAG 606 Lavatories and Sinks.

ADAAG 606.5 Exposed Pipes and Surfaces.

Water supply and drain pipes under lavatories and sinks shall be insulated or otherwise configured to protect against contact. There shall be no sharp or abrasive surfaces under lavatories and sinks.

LXII. Inaccessible paper towel dispenser in the second of two restrooms.

LXIII. Non-compliant mounted height of paper towel dispenser in the second of two restrooms exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG Advisory 606.1 General.

If soap and towel dispensers are provided, they must be located within the reach ranges specified in 308.

ADAAG 308.2 Forward Reach. ADAAG 308.2.1 Unobstructed.

Where a forward reach is unobstructed, the high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low forward reach shall be 15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.2.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a high forward reach is over an obstruction, the clear floor space shall extend beneath the element for a distance not less than the required reach depth over the obstruction. The high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum where the reach depth is 20 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 20 inches, the high forward reach shall be 44 inches maximum and the reach depth shall be 25 inches maximum.

ADAAG 308.3 Side Reach. ADAAG 308.3.1 Unobstructed.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the side reach is unobstructed, the high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low side reach shall be 15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.3.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the high side reach is over an obstruction, the height of the obstruction shall be 34 inches maximum and the depth of the obstruction shall be 24 inches maximum. The high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum for a reach depth of 10 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 10 inches, the high side reach shall be 46 inches maximum for a reach depth of 24 inches maximum.

LXIV. Inaccessible mirror in the second of two restrooms.

LXV. Non-compliant mounted height of mirror in the second of two restrooms exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 603.3 Mirrors.

Mirrors located above lavatories or countertops shall be installed with the bottom edge of the reflecting surface 40 inches (1015 mm) maximum above the finish floor or ground.

Mirrors not located above lavatories or countertops shall be installed with the bottom edge of the reflecting surface 35 inches (890 mm) maximum above the finish floor or ground.

LXVI. Inaccessible toilet compartment in the second of two restrooms.

LXVII. Required minimum clear width not provided at door of toilet compartment in the second of two restrooms.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments.

ADAAG 604.8 Toilet Compartments.

Wheelchair accessible toilet compartments shall meet the requirements of 604.8.1 and 604.8.3. Compartments containing more than one plumbing fixture shall comply with 603.

***15** Ambulatory accessible compartments shall comply with 604.8.2 and 604.8.3.

ADAAG 604.8.1.2 Doors.

Toilet compartment doors, including door hardware, shall comply with 404 except that if the approach is to the latch side of the compartment door, clearance between the door side of the compartment and any obstruction shall be 42 inches (1065 mm) minimum.

Doors shall be located in the front partition or in the side wall or partition farthest from the water closet. Where located in the front partition, the door opening shall be 4 inches (100 mm) maximum from the side wall or partition farthest from the water closet. Where located in the side wall or partition, the door opening shall be 4 inches (100 mm) maximum from the front partition. The door shall be self-closing. A door pull complying with 404.2.7 shall be placed on both sides of the door near the latch. Toilet compartment doors shall not swing into the minimum required compartment area.

ADAAG 404.2.3 Clear Width.

Door openings shall provide a clear width of 32 inches (815 mm) minimum. Clear openings of doorways with swinging doors shall be measured between the face of the door and the stop, with the door open 90 degrees.

LXVIII. Required minimum space not provided in toilet compartment in the second of two restrooms.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments.

ADAAG 604.8 Toilet Compartments.

Wheelchair accessible toilet compartments shall meet the requirements of 604.8.1 and 604.8.3. Compartments containing more than one plumbing fixture shall comply with 603. Ambulatory accessible compartments shall comply with 604.8.2 and 604.8.3.

ADAAG 604.8.1.1 Size.

Wheelchair accessible compartments shall be 60 inches (1525 mm) wide minimum measured perpendicular to the side wall, and 56 inches (1420 mm) deep minimum for wall hung water closets and 59 inches (1500 mm) deep minimum for floor mounted water closets measured perpendicular to the rear wall.

LXIX. Inaccessible water closet in toilet compartment in the second of two restrooms.

LXX. Required minimum clearance not provided at water closet in toilet compartment in the second of two restrooms.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments

ADAAG 604.3 Clearance.

Clearances around water closets and in toilet compartments shall comply with 604.3.

ADAAG 604.3.1 Size.

Clearance around a water closet shall be 60 inches (1525 mm) minimum measured perpendicular from the side wall and 56 inches (1420 mm) minimum measured perpendicular from the rear wall.

LXXI. Required grab bars not provided on rear and side walls of water closet in toilet compartment in the second of two restrooms.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments

ADAAG 604.5 Grab Bars.

Grab bars for water closets shall comply with 609.

Grab bars shall be provided on the side wall closest to the water closet and on the rear wall.

LXXII. Non-compliant distance of water compartment in the second of two restrooms.

LXXIII. Inaccessible flush control at water closet in toilet compartment in the second of two restrooms.

LXXIV. Non-compliant position of flush control located at closed side of water closet in toilet compartment in the second of two restrooms..

***16** LXXV. Closet from side wall in toilet compartment in the second of two restrooms.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments.

ADAAG 604.2 Location.

The water closet shall be positioned with a wall or partition to the rear and to one side.

The centerline of the water closet shall be 16 inches minimum to 18 inches maximum from the side wall or partition

LXXVI. Inaccessible flush control at water closet in toilet compartment in the second of two restrooms.

LXXVII. Non-compliant position of flush control located at closed side of water closet in toilet compartment in the second of two restrooms.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments.

ADAAG 604.6 Flush Controls.

Flush controls shall be hand operated or automatic. Hand operated flush controls shall comply with 309. Flush controls shall be located on the open side of the water closet except in ambulatory accessible compartments complying with 604.8.2.

14) The above listing is not to be considered all-inclusive of the barriers which exist at the Facility. Plaintiff requires an inspection of the Facility in order to determine all of the **ADA** violations.

15) The removal of the physical barriers, dangerous conditions, and **ADA** violations set forth herein is readily achievable and can be accomplished and carried out without much difficulty or expense. [42 U.S.C. § 12182\(B\)\(2\)\(A\)\(iv\)](#); [42 U.S.C. § 12181\(9\)](#); [28 C.F.R. § 36.304](#).

16) Plaintiff is without adequate remedy at law, is suffering irreparable harm, and reasonably anticipates that she will continue to suffer irreparable harm unless and until Defendants are required to remove the physical barriers, dangerous conditions, and **ADA** violations that exist at the Facility, including those set forth herein.

17) The Plaintiff has been obligated to retain undersigned counsel for the filing and prosecution of this action. The Plaintiff is entitled to have her reasonable attorney's fees, costs and expenses paid by the Defendants, pursuant to [42 U.S.C., §§ 12205](#) and 12217.

18) Pursuant to [42 U.S.C. § 12188\(a\)](#), this Court is provided with authority to grant injunctive relief to Plaintiff, including an order to alter the Facility to make it readily accessible

All Citations

Slip Copy, 2025 WL 343475

End of Document

© 2025 Thomson Reuters. No claim to original U.S. Government Works.